_

The Wednesday Group:
Civil-Military Interactions

Scribe: James L. Narel

Program on Peacekeeping Policy, The Institute of Public Policy
George Mason University
Arlington, Virginia, U.S.A.
e-mail: jnarel@gmu.edu

James Narel is Senior Research Fellow with the Program on Peacekeeping Policy, at George Mason University, and a doctoral student in the field of public policy. A retired army colonel, he was Special Assistant to the U.S. Army Chief of Staff. He taught strategic decisionmaking as a resident faculty member of the National Defense University, and ethics of the military profession at the United States Military Academy. He is a graduate of West Point and the Command and General Staff College at Fort Leavenworth, and holds advanced degrees from the University of Massachusetts and the Industrial College of the Armed Forces.

OVERVIEW

A unique feature of the Cornwallis IV conference was the workshop conducted on the third day of the proceedings. Attendees divided into syndicates and participated in a day-long analysis of civil-military interaction in a particular peace operation. This shift in methodology away from the traditional consideration of prepared papers offered conferees a change of pace and exploited the opportunity to focus their diverse talents and insights on the rich domain of civil military efforts in previous interventions. The main objective of the exercise was to identify key issues and to translate them into an agenda for future research.

Four scenarios were chosen for analysis: Northern Iraq, Bosnia-Herzegovina, Haiti, and Somalia. This selection provided a rich variety of actual civil-military responses to a diverse set of conditions and objectives. Each syndicate included one or more scholars and/or practitioners with expertise in the particular operation, who provided the overview and particulars that became grist for analysis. Addressing historical cases insured that a realistic degree of complexity and range of issues would be taken into consideration, and that both the common and contrasting requirements of different operations would be recognized. The approach encouraged the analysis of actual needs and responses, comparison and contrast among different operations, and extrapolation of particular experiences to more general applications.

The syndicates did, in fact, produce both a wealth of insights into the civil-military challenges and responses for the four situations, and a set of practical research recommendations suggested by each. In the pages that follow, detail from the discussion and debate is reported, valuable both for its capturing of the salient issues and for the diverse observations contributed by the syndicate members. A brief summary is offered here, and, for ease of access, a consolidation of the research recommendations is provided.

_____
–

THE SCENARIOS

SYNDICATE 1: NORTHERN IRAQ

Following immediately in the aftermath of the Persian Gulf War, a humanitarian crisis was precipitated by the flight of nearly half a million Kurdish refugees to the mountains of northern Iraq. Unique aspects of the civil-military challenge included the unanticipated rapid occurrence of events, the need to provide security in a territory over which the threat faction was the sovereign government, and the requirement to ensure the long-term safety of minority group members outside the area of a temporary security zone. In four distinct phases of the crisis, examples abound of both successes and failures of military and civilian agencies to effectively coordinate their efforts.

SYNDICATE 2: BOSNIA-HERZEGOVINA

In this instance a NATO-led force was dispatched to implement the elements of the Dayton Peace Agreement. The civil-military challenge entailed recognizing and accommodating a changing set of circumstances and needs. When initially deployed, the intervention force was faced with a peace enforcement mission. As confidence grew that the warring factions would abide by the treaty terms, a shift in priorities had to be undertaken toward the civil, political, and humanitarian aspects of the operation. The syndicate analysis evaluates the effectiveness of the specific agencies and overall structure of the effort to achieve civil-military cooperation.

SYNDICATE 3: HAITI

A considerable amount of advanced planning was accomplished prior to the Haiti intervention, which was primarily a U.S. military operation in its initial phase. Nevertheless, lapses in coordination between military and civilian agencies were common. Furthermore, the persistent troubles of this struggling nation has necessitated a long-term commitment to support the development of democratic institutions, most notably international support for the training of a professional civilian police force. Civil-military cooperation can be studied under four headings: military and police, military and human rights organizations, and military and diplomats.

SYNDICATE 4: SOMALIA

The environment for civil-military relations throughout the Somalia crisis was extremely challenging. Agencies attempting to ward off famine in a failed state with well armed

_____
_

warring factions felt forced to reach an accommodation with the warlords. As the military forces became more deeply engaged in combat operations, aid workers found themselves caught in the middle. When military forces were precipitately withdrawn, the humanitarian agencies were left facing very difficult challenges. Relations of both the military and the civilian organizations with and the media are of special concern in this crisis.

PROPOSED RESEARCH ISSUES

The issues summarized here are elaborated upon and provided with contextual reference in the detailed syndicate reports that follow.

SYNDICATE 1: NORTHERN IRAQ

- Determining the critical elements of effective civil-military decision making in a coalition environment.
- Analyzing the challenges of conducting forward planning a great distance from national headquarters.

- Identifying systematic criteria for determining whether to intervene in a crisis.

- Analyzing the challenge of maintaining national commitment for peacekeeping operations.

- Expanding the military doctrine of "unity of effort" for all participants.

- Analyzing the kinds of decisions common to peace operations with an eye to identifying the seemingly small issues that tend to have big consequences.

- Evaluating effects of "role changes" on the military. For example, are leaders accustomed to making command decisions able to employ consensual techniques when appropriate?

- Identifying and organizing resources in a peace operations headquarters to ensure that the right materials are available to the appropriate parties.

- Evaluating whether and/or how assigning an Operational Analysis group to the commander could help identify and address civil-military issues unique to peace operations.

- Examining how the experience of U.S. National Guard units, accustomed to performing disaster relief operations, including subsequent hand-off to civilian agencies, can be "exported" to U.S. active duty military units.

_____
_

- Developing a simulation to model civilian populations in crisis environments that could be used to anticipate likely public responses to particular crises and relief efforts.

- Establishing operating standards for NGOs and DARTs that could serve as operational guidelines and criteria for evaluating performance.

- Identifying disconnects between responsibility and authority in the policy- and decision-making aspects of peace operations, to ensure that those elements charged with the responsibility for achieving certain ends possess sufficient authority to bring them about.

- Identifying the leader attributes that are especially important for those in charge of peace operations, and ensuring that senior leaders are selected accordingly.

SYNDICATE 2: BOSNIA HERZEGOVINA

- Determining what education and training are requisite for the military and civil actors in an intervention, both on a contingency basis and as part of the pre-deployment preparations.

- Identifying the critical elements of a culture and its conflicting factional interests that must be understood in order to shape a successful intervention.

- Identifying the key factors of conflict in a society that may require an international intervention, as well as existing mechanisms that may contribute to achieving resolution.
- Analysis of participating agencies to identify inter-organizational differences in their IT-related systems that may disrupt the flow and dissemination of critical information.

- Identifying the methods and mechanisms that should be established to improve co-ordination of information among the diverse "audiences" in an intervention.

- Cataloging "user needs" for various types of information in an intervention.

- Development of a "civil doctrine" for intervention, and an overarching "strategic doctrine" for civil-military interaction. Its elements would include measures of effectiveness; a framework of legitimacy, accountability, and governance; balanced provision of near and long-term aid; and means for determining exit criteria for both military and civilian agencies.

- Determining differences in the "motivational alignment" among various actors.

_

- Defining or developing a process to link the main actors and agendas.

- Determining how such a process to link actors and agendas of intervenors can be extended to the local population and factions.

- Identifying the resources that need to be allocated to each civil-military task.

SYNDICATE 3: HAITI

- Developing a methodology and creating a mechanism for estimating a time frame and determining resource requirements to achieve the objectives of an intervention (including those that must continue after a military withdrawal).

- Identifying the factors that contribute to the deterioration of public order and degradation of civil police effectiveness following withdrawal of military intervention forces.

- Identifying the indicators by which civil and military leaders can judge that sufficient stability has been achieved to schedule withdrawal of military forces.

- Discerning the areas where the disconnect between military and civil agencies causes the greatest delays or disruptions and focusing efforts there on increasing civil-military cooperation.

- Identifying key civil-military links and developing a mechanism to ensure their timely establishment.

SYNDICATE 4: SOMALIA

- Evaluating the degree to which the effort to coordinate communications among civilian actors worked during UNOSOM I and UNITAF, respectively.

- Tracing the relative effectiveness of the United Nations' Humanitarian Operations Center (HOC) across the phases of the operation—UNISOM I, UNITAF, and UNISOM II.
- Determining the accuracy and usefulness of the surveys conducted by the Humanitarian Assistance Survey Team (HAST) and the Office for Foreign Disaster Assistance (OFDA).

- Reviewing and analyzing the interaction in Somalia intervention between the civil-military effort and the media.

- Determining how to enhance and optimize a civil-military operations center (CMOC).