

*Latin American Lessons Noted in
Peace Operations and Disaster Response:
Toward a Framework for Regional
Collaboration*

**Presentation to
The Cornwallis Group
17 April 2013
by
Margaret Daly Hayes, PhD
Evidence Based Research
and Georgetown University**

Agenda

- **The new C2: Coordinate and Collaborate**
- **Two Examples from Latin America**
 - **MINUSTAH - Lessons Noted**
 - **Earthquake response – Haiti**
- **Toward a Collaboration Framework**

The MINUSTAH Operation in Haiti

- **In a situation of growing violence, President Aristide resigns and departs the country in February 2004**
- **29 February, UN Resolution 1529 authorizes an *Interim Multinational Force* for three months**
 - **Establish an environment of security**
 - **Facilitate provision of humanitarian assistance**
 - **Support the continuation of a peaceful, constitutional political process**
 - **MIF force includes: 2000 US, 900 French, 500 Canadian and 300 Chilean**
- **Resolution 1542 on 30 April 2004, authorizes a *Haiti Stabilization Mission*, under Chapter VII.**
 - **Brazil in lead**

MINUSTAH - Tasking

- **Military Responsibilities**
 - Security in the cities,
 - Protection of vital institutions
 - Facilitate security on the highways/roads
 - Dissuade and stop violent armed groups and criminals
 - Defend access to the humanitarian infrastructure
- **“These oblige the military force to participate, from the first moment, in the most diverse activities, including almost all of both military operations and humanitarian activities.”**
- **“MINUSTAH has both a role and structure that is extremely limited for coordinating humanitarian activity and development projects in Haiti.”**

Challenges to Performance

- **Slow sourcing and deployment of troops**
- **Differences between the capabilities planned for and those that were obtainable**
 - Of 7000 soldiers, only 2500 available at any one time
 - Insufficient numbers of police
- **Unfamiliarity with UN organization and systems**
 - Civilian logistics and contracts
 - Civilians and military have different priorities
- **Deficiency in air support**
- **Lack of an Intelligence service**
- **Armed groups**
- **Relations with the International Organizations and NGOs providing humanitarian assistance**
- **A Joint Staff with presence of all countries**
 - Fluidity with written and spoken English and/or French essential
 - Non-speakers relegated to background (second level)
- **Capability to deal with the Media**
- **Lack of development projects**

Lessons Noted - Availability

- **Peace Ops require institutions to be current/up-to-date**
 - With standardized procedures for planning, operations and logistics; they must comply with UNSAS
 - A Joint capability for planning, execution and sustainment of operation is useful
 - ROE must agree with UN ROE established for the operation
 - A SOFA should be agreed
- **The Peace Force should not be improvised**
 - Neither at the country level, nor
 - At the Coalition level
- **Chile deployed in 48 hours; A neighbor took more than a year.**
- **More than 6 months to secure the full force**

Lessons Noted - Planning

- **Policy: What is needed?**
 - **Joint planning capability with permanent Combined Joint Staff that can communicate with the individual forces**
 - **A Reconnaissance Unit that can deploy rapidly is necessary**
 - **It is useful to combine capabilities. For example, Ecuadorean Engineers incorporated to Chilean unit.**
 - **Relations between military forces and UNPOL must be understood**

Lessons Noted - Planning-2

- **Operations**

- **The Peace Operations Instrucción should be broadened and deepened to clarify**
 - **Juridical obligations**
 - **Urban combat; urban patrol**
 - **Helo operations**
 - **Negotiation techniques**
 - **Radio procedures**
 - **Sanitation**
 - **English language capability, plus others**
 - **Coordination and synchronization with UNPOL, NGOs, Red Cross, local authorities, and other military forces**
 - **Press and legal capabilities should be included**

- **Per UNSAS and Brahimi recommendations**

Lessons Noted - Planning-3

- **Command and Control**
 - **Doctrines must be reconciled with UN Documents**
 - **Support to Police**
 - How is this defined?
 - What are the limits of “public security” activities?
 -
 - **ROE – updated to PeaceOps requirements**
 - **Personnel – Units should be organized well prior to deployment**
 - **Consider the costs and benefits of selecting personnel from different components and/or from organic units**
 - **Unified rules of discipline must be maintained for the entire force.**

Lessons Noted - Logistics

- **Combined logistics is the ideal**
- **It is necessary to understand how UN contracting works**
- **If the mission is to eliminate an existing conflict (Chap VII), the logistics must be those of a war operation, not a traditional peace operation (Chap VI).**

Lessons Noted – Logistics Elements

- **Consider the length of sustainment**
 - 50 days of MRE (yuck!)
- **Vehicles – means for loading, unloading and transport**
- **Clothing – appropriate to the local climate**
- **Fuels: recommend use of vehicles with a single class of fuel**
- **Spare parts – a systems for synchronizing equipment is needed; capacity to support from distance**
- **Maintenance – a variety of makes and models complicate maintenance**
 - Standardize the equipment to be used in PeaceOps
- **Sanitation –**
 - Consider HOW medical evacuation will occur
 - Plan for a prior vaccination program
- **Transport – equipment must be adequate for assigned tasks and for coordination**
- **Finances – Understand the nature of UN contracts, methods of payment and systems for reimbursement**

Lessons Noted – Humanitarian Assistance

- **Assistance arrives continually, but uncoordinated**
- **Armed Forces must undertake some humanitarian assistance activities**
- **“Nevertheless, it is very far from improving the quality of life of Haitians, because, with the current attitude one can only achieve short term, palliative effects, feeding the culture of ‘*I don’t work, someone will provide*’....” (Gen Heleno)**
- **It is desirable to guide the local authorities toward replacing or improving their systems**
 - **Police, Judiciary**
 - **Health**
 - **Education**
 - **Agriculture**

“At the poorest level and practically without attention”

Haiti Earthquake 2010



The Earthquake

- On January 12, 2010, 16:53 local time, a catastrophic 7.0 earthquake struck Haiti, killing 230,000, injuring thousands of others, and leaving more than 1 million people homeless.
- 14 of 16 government ministries and the Presidential palace destroyed
- Most medical facilities (hospitals, clinics) damaged or destroyed
- Minustah headquarters collapsed, killing 101, including the Head of Mission and his principal deputy.
- Haitian government issues disaster declaration and requests humanitarian assistance from the US and the international community at large

Key Earthquake Damage

- **Most communications infrastructure destroyed or heavily damaged**
- **Many buildings, government and private, collapsed or uninhabitable (More than 4000 physical structures were destroyed or damaged in Port-au-Prince)**
- **Debris made many roads impassable**
- **Airport closed; tower out**
- **Security situation fragile – prisons evacuated; police impacted by disaster**
- **Population devastated**
 - **Many trapped under rubble**
 - **Massive injuries**
 - **Families separated**
 - **No access to water, food, or shelter**

Haiti Damage Zones (Jan 13, 2010)

ESTIMATED POPULATION EXPOSURE

Intensity	Population exposed	Perceived shaking	STRUCTURE DAMAGE	
			Resistant	Vulnerable
10	137,000	Extreme	Very heavy	Very heavy
9	101,000	Violent	Moderate/heavy	Heavy
8	1,157,000	Very strong	Moderate	Moderate/heavy
7	2,023,000	Strong	Light	Moderate
6	1,349,000	Moderate	Very light	Light
5	6,604,000	Light	None	None

19°



18°

74°

73°

72°

Organization of Response Communities

- **UN in lead.**
- **Following UN protocols, response activities were largely organized around UN-defined functional activities (Clusters)**
 - **Search and Rescue Teams**
 - **Medical**
 - **Airport and Air Transportation**
 - **Physical Security**
 - **Food and Water**
 - **Shelter and Non-Food Items**
 - **Separated Families and Children**
 - **Telecommunications and Information Technology**

Airport and Air Transport

- **Port-au-Prince (10,000 foot runway) tower and terminal heavily damaged, with few paved alternatives Cap-Haitien (4000 ft), Jacmel (3300 ft.), and Le Cayes (3300 ft.)**
- **US Special Forces team took ATF control (at Haitian govt request) on the evening of January 13**
 - Initial capacity 25-40 flights per day, later up to 100, 125
 - No initial **mechanism** to coordinate in-coming flight plans
 - Many flights diverted to Dominican Republic
- **Airport facilities quickly overwhelmed**
 - Limited storage for off-loaded goods; Road access blocked by debris; Cap-Haitien had poor road access
 - Logistics base established adjacent to airport
- **NGO (Doctors Without Borders) complained of lack of priority January 16, creating media distraction**
- **Protocols needed for coordination of**
 - Flight Planning
 - Road clearing
 - Transportation of goods
 - Linkages to distribution system (NGO, US, UN, Haiti)

Search and Rescue

- **Search and Rescue Teams from around the world**
 - First in – Iceland via Boston. Arrived January 13
 - More than 50 international search and rescue teams
- **Function under established international protocol**
 - Team alerts by World Food Programme (WFP)
 - Deployed upon request of host government
 - Teams selected by WFP
 - First team on site coordinates activities (fire fighter model)
 - WFP deploys to take charge
 - Actually heavily self-synchronized
- **Support needed**
 - Mapping of requirements
 - Physical security of teams
 - For many teams, transportation

Medical

- **Established international protocol (rely on local capabilities) severely challenged because health infrastructure was destroyed,**
 - **Argentine field hospital only one initially available**
 - **Israel, Russia, Nicaragua, Mexico, Turkey, France, Indonesia, many LatAm countries sent field hospitals. Some urgent cases treated aboard naval vessels**
- **Medical Response – Many countries sent medical teams**
 - **Medical capacity extremely limited, primitive treatments “civil war medicine”**
 - **Thousands of survivors treated in dozens of facilities**
 - **Many patients evacuated to Dominican Republic, Guantanamo Bay, Jamaica, Martinique, Miami and elsewhere**
- **Decision making (location, transportation, support, patient assignment) conducted through Humanitarian Assistance Coordination Center (HACC), UN, and Haitian Ministry of Health**
 - **Considerable self-synchronization**
 - **Challenges included medical supplies, sanitization, post-op care, and patient load**
- **Support needed for ground transportation and physical security**

Food and Water

- **Need for food and clean water resulted in large flows from outside Haiti**
 - **Serious difficulty coordinating arrivals**
 - **Ports inoperable ; Air transport not well-organized**
 - **Dominican Republic airfields opened immediately**
 - **Coordination evolved; Miami and other nearby airports used as staging areas**
 - **Distribution a challenge**
 - **Limited storage at airports; Roads blocked**
 - **Logistics to move goods from airports**
 - **Distribution points required planning and coordination**
 - **Physical security for stockpiles and distribution locations needed**
- **Alternative mechanisms explored**
 - **Air drops of food and water (safety of drop zones, control of desperate population)**
 - **Unescorted vehicles and convoys (physical security challenges)**
 - **Police and military organization of victim population, controlled distribution**
 - **NGO-driven system involving ID cards, family needs and physical security**
- **Support needed for local storage, inventory management (barcode technology), ground transportation, and physical security.**

Shelter and Non-Food Items

- **Massive damage to housing, fear of aftershocks and further collapses put the population in the streets (more than 1.3 million displaced)**
 - People occupied parks, golf courses, and other open areas
 - International Organization for Migration (IOM), already present, initiated shelter coordination
 - International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC), the formal Emergency Shelter Cluster lead, arrived on January 14 to assess situation
 - First IFRC-coordinated supplies arrived from Santo Domingo on January 16
 - Continuous shortages of shelter materials and tents
 - The Emergency Shelter Cluster is comprised of nearly 70 humanitarian agencies
- **Varying degrees of local organization and security for different displaced persons camps**
 - Government encouraged groups to move out of damaged areas to countryside to relieve population pressure
 - Many desired to stay near their homes to protect property and in hope of rescues from the rubble

Physical Security

- **Security a persistent concern from beginning, however situation remained relatively calm.**
 - MINUSTAH had successfully cleaned out violent gangs and Haitian Police were functioning well when quake hit.
 - Jails collapsed and gang leaders/members escaped.
 - First counts showed half of police in Port-au-Prince absent.
 - Widespread violence, looting failed to materialize (only scattered incidents)
 - Government imposed curfew until February 14. Security situation remained stable
- **Population:**
 - Focused on rescue and recovery of bodies. Police involved in clearing bodies.
 - Desperation increased with slow delivery of food and water; military escorts were required for early distribution of food and water.
- **Security force response**
 - Crowd control handled by MINUSTAH with US military in support.
 - US ceased convoy escort as police reappeared (80% strength by January 30)
 - Police become more visible: escorting water trucks, guarding banks and Western Union while working without pay and with one meal per day.

Telecommunications and IT

- **Communications infrastructure heavily damaged**
 - Cell towers down, landlines heavily impacted, Telco HQ collapsed
 - Widespread power outages
 - Banking sector and GofH unable to communicate
 - Caribbean and Dominican telcoms open National systems to Haiti
 - Communications restored piecemeal with text messaging and spotty internet leading the way
 - MINUSTAH responsible for infrastructure in main areas
- **WFP leads the emergency telecommunications cluster**
 - UN IT emergency responders from Dubai and Rome arrive January 15
 - UN OCHA implemented OneResponse, website for responders
 - Private sector firms contributed to restoration of commercial capacity
 - Defense Information Systems Agency (DISA) at SOUTHCOM in Miami testing web portal (APAN) for disaster relief
- **Innovative use of crowd-sourcing**
 - Translation
 - Mapping

Unique Situational Factors in Haiti

- **Strong International presence Before the Earthquake**
 - UN Development Assistance – with Established Protocols
 - MINUSTAH (United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti)
 - IO/NGO Development Activities
 - USAID and other international assistance activities
- **Geographic proximity to potential relief sources**
 - Dominican Republic – opened borders
 - United States
 - Caribbean, Central and South America
- **Large Expatriate Haitian Community – translations, money**
- **Readiness and Awareness**
 - Deputy Commander of SOUTHCOM (LtGen Keen) in Haiti preparing for hurricane response exercises
 - LtGen Keen and MajGen Floriano Peixoto (MINUSTAH force commander) met in 1984 in Brazil and had worked together in several situations.
 - US-UN collaboration agreed with clear division of responsibilities

Where are the Protocols?

(Amb Camilo Ospina (Col) following the 2007 Peru Earthquake)

Toward a coordinated and collaborative Framework

Insecurities in our Hemisphere

Traditional Military Threats

Armed threats to the State

WMD

Guerrillas/insurgency

Mafia Criminality

Drug trafficking
Organized crime
Arms trafficking
Money laundering
Traffic in people
Illegal migration
Environment
Terrorism

Structural Problems

Poverty, human rights
Corruption/transparency
Political and institutional instability
Contagious disease
Economic instability
Population growth
Social unrest
Joblessness
Indigenous demands
Returned deportees

Natural Disasters

Nuclear/biological accidents

Conversations Overheard (2007)

- **This moment in history is different**
- **We live in a time of extremely necessary transformations**
- **We seek to work multilaterally, collaborating**
- **We want to optimize relations between civilians and military**
- **The subject of security has broadened, but not deepened**
- **The UN wants collaboration with regional and other organizations**
- **What do we do?**
- **Two approaches – UNSAS; Network-enabled**

Stand-by Arrangements - UNSAS

- **Various BRIGADES – multinational, coherent, created by the member States**
 - Readiness periodically confirmed
 - Training and equipment confirmed
 - Civpol, justice, corrections and human rights experts on call and READY
 - Integrated civilian-military task forces
- **Consider *combined regional coalitions* and programs for training in UN doctrine and standards - CFAC, RSS, UNASUR**
- **Acquisition procedures standardized to facilitate rapid deployment**
 - Contracts with civilian providers
 - Stockpiles – eg., UNLB-Brindisi

Principles of Networked Operations

A force enabled by network

improves

Exchange of information

***Exchanges of information
and Collaboration***

increase

***Quality of information
and
Shared Situational Awareness***

Shared Situational Awareness

facilitates

***Collaboration and
Self-Synchronization***

Collaboration and Synchronization Increase Mission Effectiveness

NATO Network-Enabled C2 Maturity Framework

Edge C2	Not Explicit, Self-Allocated (Emergent, Tailored, and Dynamic)	Unlimited Sharing as Required	All Available and Relevant Information Accessible
Collaborative C2	Collaborative Process and Shared Plan	Significant Broad Sharing	Additional Information Across Collaborative Areas/Functions
Coordinated C2	Coordination Process and Linked Plans	Limited Focused Sharing	Additional Information About Coordinated Areas/Functions
Deconflicted C2	Establish Constraints	Very Limited Sharply Focused Sharing	Additional Information About Constraints and Seams
Conflicted C2	None	No Sharing of Information	Organic Information
	Allocation of Decision Rights to the Collective	Inter-Entity Information Sharing Behaviors	Distribution of Information (Entity Information Positions)

Preliminary C2 Assessment: Haiti

	Conflicted	Deconflicted	Coordinated	Collaborative	Agile/Edge
Search and Rescue			WFP/PMA protocols		Self-synchrony
Medical Response					
Air Transport					
Physical Security				Minustah and US	
Food and Water					
Shelter and non-food					Self-synchrony
DPs families and Children			Protocols		
Telecom and IT			UN and Private Sector		Considerable Self-synchrony
SUMMARY	In SAR Phase	In Rescue Phase	In Relief Phase	Some	Islands of Self-synchrony

Inputs to a Shared Framework

- **Readiness according to UNSAS and NATO**
 - http://www.un.org/Depts/dpko/milad/fgs2/unsas_files/sba.htm
 - [NATO Standardization Agreements](#)
- **Model protocols based on “best practices”**
- **Dissemination and exchange of information and of lessons “noted” and “learned”**
 - Transparency
 - Combined exercises
- **Modifications of protocols based on lessons learned**
- **Regional and subregional collaboration to build common response frameworks**
- **The OAS/IADB should “*promote interaction and cooperation with similar regional and international organizations, on technical issues related to military and defense*”**

Command and Control requires a strategic staff that is “joint, combined, and inter-agency, --on purpose and from the start.”

Col Mike Capstick, CF – ISAF Report

Thank you!

Contact info:

mdhayes@ebrinc.com

Partial Bibliography

- **Brahimi Report:**
http://www.un.org/spanish/peace/operations_report/
- **G.D. Augusto Heleno Ribeiro Pereira, “El Componente Militar de la Misión de las Naciones Unidas para la Estabilización de Haití,”** *Military Review*, enero-febrero 2007.
- **Discurso Gen Heleno na Memorial de America Latina em São Paulo, 11 setembro 2006**
<http://www.memorial.sp.gov.br/memorial/RssNoticiaDetalhe.do?noticiald=788>
- **Harold Kauer Tapia, “Análisis y lecciones de la participación chilena en Haití,”** *Revista de Marina* 2:2006 (109-127).
- **Paulo Tripodi y Andrés Villar, “Haití: la encrucijada de una intervención latinoamericana,”** *Revista Fuerzas Armadas y Sociedad*, 19:1 (2005) pp 17-35.